DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 345 979 SO 021 820

AUTHOR Killam, Rosemary N.
TITLE Women in Academic Music: How We Have Achieved Our Roles.
PUB DATE 89
NOTE 23p.; Paper presented at the Annual Women in Music Symposium, (3rd, Buffalo, NY, 1989).
PUB TYPE Reports - Research/Technical (143) -- Speeches/Conference Papers (150)

EDRS PRICE MF01/PC01 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS College Faculty; *Educational Research; *Females; Higher Education; Music Education; *Musicians; *Professional Development; Surveys; *Teaching (Occupation); Womens Education

ABSTRACT

In October 1987, approximately 5,300 female, full-time professors of music, found on the College Music Society list, were sent surveys. The complete responses numbered 1,081, and included responses to questions on subjects such as role of performance, age at which music was chosen as profession, jobs held to pay for education, obstacles to education, self-description, and areas of professional specialization. The results provided an outline of the professional roles of women and how they have been achieved. Among the findings are: (1) music as a profession was decided early in women's lives; (2) one-third attended pre-college music camp; (3) nearly half are concentrated in the areas of the keyboard and voice; (4) three-fourths considered themselves performers; (5) very few are ethnic minorities; (6) over half considered themselves non-active feminists; (7) over half have tenure; (8) 58% have yearly incomes between $20,000 and $35,000. (DB)

****
* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
* from the original document. *
****

ED345979

WOMEN IN ACADEMIC MUSIC: HOW WE HAVE ACHIEVED OUR ROLES

Rosemary N. Killam

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
Office of Educational Research and Improvement
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

X This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it.

☐ Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality.

• Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official OERI position or policy.

"PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY
ROSEMARY N. KILLAM
TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)."

SO 021 820

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

"Women in Academic Music: How We Have Achieved Our Roles"

INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND

The work reported in this paper is historical research, done with women musicians as my colleagues, not a study of women musicians as my subjects. The research started as a study of the folklore of women musicians. The focus changed with the addition of Laura Prillwitz as co-author of the questionnaire. Ms. Prillwitz was at that time counselling groups of students in the area of performance anxiety. (Her professional commitment has now changed to the area of women's shelters; she is no longer actively involved in the study.) I initiated the study and continue analysis of the results because I believe that our profession needs the information about women academic musicians.

In the summer of 1989, Ms. Prillwitz and I spent two months refining our information goals and developing the questionnaire format to achieve those goals. We sent drafts of the questionnaire to some half dozen people around the country for critique; we revised in light of their comments. Originally, we planned to send the survey to music departments, and ask that the questionnaire be distributed to women faculty. Once we determined the availability of the College Music Society list of full-time women faculty, the project became bigger and more expensive than I could fund with research money available. An emergency faculty research grant from the University of North Texas assisted the early stages of the research.

METHODOLOGY

In October 1987, all women fulltime faculty members on the list procured from CMS (approximately 5,300) were sent three-page surveys. My students, family and friends volunteered time to paste labels on envelopes (omitting those names we knew to be of men), stuffed envelopes, zip code ordered, banded and mailed the approximately 5,300 questionnaires--no small task, I would caution anyone who plans to undertake it. We added notes to any recipients whom we knew, urging their participation and support. The total number of questionnaires returned was gratifying and is summarized in Table 1.

--INSERT TABLE 1 ABOUT HERE--

Ms. Prillwitz logged the surveys as they returned, along with the postmark when legible, so the state of origin of most of the questionnaires is known. Thus we have a rough idea of the distribution of the responses. Questionnaires were returned from every state in the nation. Starting in January 1988, questionnaires were separated by state. The questionnaires kept returning at such a steady rate that we postponed cutoff until mid-April, 1988. (The last were returned from women on sabbatical leaves.)

We began computer entry in mid-May, 1988. All told, seven people worked on computer entry, in the ad hoc mixture of volunteer and underpaid labor that I am beginning to believe

characterizes women's research. Each questionnaire's information was separated into three different files: 1. exclusively numeric, precoded on coding sheets, 2. primarily numeric, 3. primarily verbal. File separation was made on the skills of the typists. Those of us who were more accurate with alpha information entered verbal material; those of us who were more accurate with numeric entry handled that. When entry started, the computing center didn't know how much information could be logged into a given file. We discovered this limitation by entering until the system refused any more input for a given file--a fairly startling occurrence the first time the system generated such messages. Our budget didn't allow for duplication of the 3,300 pages of questionnaires. Astoundingly, none of the original questionnaires--now coffee-stained, rain-spattered and dogeared from much carrying to and from entry at various computer labs across campus (and in some cases on a personal computer in another city, then uploaded via floppy disk)--seems to have been lost. Half a floppy disk's worth had to be re-entered when a young visitor immersed the disk in some soft drink and then crumpled the disk in an attempted re-insertion. One volunteer panicked when she thought she had finished the data from the state of Iowa too late for its inclusion with the general database. The number of those choosing to answer any given question varied considerably; on some questions, more than one response is possible. The entire database has been proofed and corrected several times, but occasional entry errors or

misinterpretations of handwriting and spelling were not always clear to the seven people who participated in data entry (for example, the respondent who listed her year of birth as 1987 must have been distracted at the moment of putting pen to questionnaire.) At the very fastest, three surveys per hour were entered by any individual; the total entry took at least 365 hours.

The database from this survey is over three megabytes in size. This file size is beyond the University of North Texas Computing Center's experience in hand-entered files of mixed text and numeric information. I have sought advice on analysis from colleagues across the country; Computing Center personnel have valiantly explored the most effective methods of data sorting and analysis. I think that we have developed ways through commercial software such as SAS, of preserving the information's integrity, minimizing subjectivity and providing meaningful analysis.

RESULTS

Respondents' average year of birth was 1943. Minorities are extremely under-represented, with 97% of the women reporting ourselves as Caucasian. The area of the country most reported as a point of residence in some period of life was the midwest, at 28%; followed by the south, at 19%; and the east, at 16%. Eight percent of us report some period of time spend in Europe.

Our family status depicted the complexity of our lives. Over half of us (51%) are currently married, with an additional 14% reporting that they were married, but are no longer. (This

included a number of widows.) Sixteen percent do not plan to marry (including a number of women religious) while 12% of us are unsure of our marriage plans. Over three-quarters (76%) of us report ourselves as primary financial support, with an additional 24% reporting spouse as our primary financial support. Forty-six percent of us have children, with an additional 8% planning to have children, and 11% of us are unsure of our plans. Over one-third (35%) live alone and are primarily responsible for the maintenance of our living quarters. Twenty-eight percent of us share that responsibility equally with others, while 24% of us primarily responsible for living quarters maintenance, but live with others. Only 6% of us report that another person is primarily responsible for living quarters maintenance. To paraphrase one respondent, "The bottom line is . . . I've concertized on several continents, made several albums, and I'm still cleaning the toilets."

Forty-eight per cent of us list ourselves as instrumental performers, 23% as vocal performers, and 28% of us list ourselves as primarily non-performers. Ninety-eight percent of us consider ourselves as classical (as opposed to pop/jazz) musicians. More of our female than our male relatives tend to be involved in music: 17% of our mothers (11% of our fathers) are or have been musicians; 11% of our sisters (8% of our brothers), 13% of our spouse/mates, and an equal 6% of grandparents (male and female).

Over half of us are tenured (51%), and nearly an additional one-third (29%) are not tenured but on the tenure track.

one-third (29%) are not tenured but on the tenure track. However, our reported rank is greatest at the assistant professor level (29%), with 27% reporting associate professor rank, and 19% reporting full professor status. An additional 7% list ourselves as having administrative rank and duties. However, no one listed herself as exclusively an administrator. Eighty percent of us consider our departments to be supportive of women.

Forty-two percent of us reported a yearly income over $30,000; 41% of us reported a yearly income of $20,000 - $30,000, and 17% of us reported incomes under $20,000. We paid for our educations through a number of methods, with one-third of us reporting parental help; 28%, scholarships and grants; 27%, our own work; and 12%, loans. Thirty-seven percent of us attended pre-college music camps, and five per cent of us attended a high school for the arts.

--INSERT TABLE 3, about here--

Early in our lives, we chose music as our profession, as shown in Table 2. Nearly 5% of us had decided by age five. An additional 12% of us had made the decision by age ten. Another 28% had decided by age 15. The largest group of us chose our area of music in our mid-to-late teens, with less than 10% of us deciding after the traditional age (approximately 22) of entry into graduate school.

A summary of the jobs we held to pay for our education is

presented in Table 3. We reported a total of more than 2,800 jobs--almost 3 per respondent--

--INSERT TABLE 3, about here--

with the highest percentage in the category of teaching private lessons. The second highest category was professional performance, followed by college teaching.

Although relatively few respondents chose to answer the question, "When you perform, do you pay more attention to technique or emotional aspects?" 57% of those responding answered "technique" and 43% answered "emotional aspects." This question arose from Ms. Prillwitz' performance anxiety counselling. Her work led to her concern at the large number of music students to whom beta blockers were prescribed for performance anxiety, a figure not borne out by the women answering the questionnaire. Nearly 87% of them reported never taking beta blockers, and many of them commented that they didn't know what beta blockers are. As a group, we reported looking forward to performance, being only slightly anxious when performing, and disagreeing slightly with the statement that anxiety interferes with our performance. This information is summarized in Figure 1, "Role of Performance in Our Lives."

--INSERT TABLE 4, about here--

Note that most of us completed the series of questions

dealing with self-image and self-description, although these questions were placed on the third page of the questionnaire, in contrast to the obstacles to education, which appeared on the first page. (This was done to maximize paper use, not from any psychological intent.) Over 1,000 of us chose to rate two of the fourteen statements of possible obstacles to our education. Of the 29 statements of self-description on the third page of the questionnaire, 25 of them were rated by more than 1,000 of us. Note that the four statements least likely to be rated were "marriage could have a positive effect on my career," "children could have a positive effect on my career," " my instrument is highly visible (soloistic)," and "I mainly perform in groups." Our average rating of these four least-rated statements varied widely.

As a group, we disagreed (and that only slightly) with two statements only: "I have been sexually harassed" (3.69) and "I am highly political" (3.55). In light of the extensive anecdotal evidence from some women of sexual harassment, as well as the surprise of some colleagues at this information, I suggest several possible interpretations for our neutrality to slight disagreement with the statement on sexual harassment: 1) music is a field in which women have been accepted historically and harassment may not be a significant problem in many segments of it (please consult lists of specialization given later in this paper); 2) the women answering the survey have strong positive self-images and are likely to deflect or deter sexual harassment;

3) those of us answering the survey may be so strongly centered on our professional roles that we choose not to identify sexual harassment as such if we encounter it; 4) music is a brutally competitive art; those subject to any possible negative environmental factors such as minority status or sexual harassment may have left the field before achieving the professional status of those of us to whom this survey was directed.

Note that as a group, we agreed most strongly with the statements: "I am an extrovert" and "I am highly self-motivated." Note that neither statements deals with specifically musical attributes such as, "My professional status as a musician is crucial to me" or "I am an excellent musician." The difference is small in the ratings of all four of these statements. I suggest that these ratings form an integrated description of our roles, since 71% of us identified ourselves as active performers rather than non-performers. Performance probably requires or at least encourages qualities of extroversion. Since musical performers must spend years of constant solitary practice to prepare for public performance, self-motivation for an extroverted individual is probably necessary.

As a group, we were most in agreement on our ratings of "I am an excellent musician" and "I am highly self-motivated" (s.d.=.81) but least in agreement with our rating that, "I am paid less than male colleagues with the same training and

experience" (s.d.=1.56).

Having now delineated many of our evaluations and methods of achievements, let me specify the 62 categories into which we placed our areas of professional specialization, together with the question which engendered these 62 different responses, in Table 6. Note that none of us identified herself as administrator solely.

--INSERT TABLE 6, about here--

I found these 62 categories to be too many to grasp, so I have expanded and combined some of the specifications made on the questionnaire, into a total of eight categories, as summarized in Table 7. Note that the category of "keyboard" is the largest, at 295. The second largest performance grouping

--INSERT TABLE 7, about here--

I have made is that of "voice," at 267. The third largest grouping is one of "multiple responsibilities," at 169. "Musicologists and theorists" are the fourth largest group, followed by "strings (including harp)," "Music education and music therapy," "winds (including sax and piccolo)" and a grouping of "composers and conductors." Note that we are very under-represented in such areas as brass and percussion. The

totals of the combined categories shown in Table 7 are greater than the number of respondents, since some of us listed more than one area. Also, some 7% of us listed ourselves elsewhere in the questionnaire as having administrative duties.

SUMMARY

We can now start to sketch in an outline of our professional roles in music and how we have achieved them. We decided on music as our profession early in our lives. Over one-third of us attended pre-college music camp, as a confirmation of our professional decisions. Nearly half of us are concentrated in the areas of keyboard and voice, but we report a wide range and configuration of musical specializations. We rated no obstacles to education as particularly difficult. We worked at a number of jobs (primarily related to our profession of music) to earn money for our education. Nearly three-quarters of us consider ourselves performers. Very few of us are from ethnic minorities or are in areas of music we consider to be other than classical. We are firmly settled in our careers, having been born, on average, in 1943. Over half of us are tenured; 56% of us are assistant or associate professors. The yearly incomes of 58% of us are between $20,000 and $35,000; 80% of us consider our departments to be supportive of women.

Nearly three-quarters of us have been romantically involved with another musician. Sixty-five per cent of us are or have been married. Less than half of us have children; over one-third of us plan no children, a firm decision in view of our average

age. More than three-quarters of us are primarily self-supporting. Not surprisingly, we tend not to answer questions dealing with child care and parenthood.

We consider ourselves to be extroverted and highly self-motivated. Over half of us consider ourselves non-active feminists; we rate ourselves as neutral in our political concerns. We center our concern on our professional achievements and we have no great anxiety about the role of performance in our lives.

CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

To conclude, we have achieved our roles as women academic musicians through lifelong dedication to our art. We concentrate our energies on our artistic endeavors. We consider our departments as supportive of us (although I would question this in light of our reported rank and income). Many of us hold positions of multiple responsibilities. We enjoy performing, but acknowledge that performance brings some stress to our lives. We don't find that stress to be unduly taxing. Our roles as women academic musicians provide us with highly positive self-images.

Finally, I would recommend:

1. Make sure that your institution reports sex and employment status accurately to the College Music Society, and to other agencies which collect such statistics. The number of women listing themselves as part-time or adjunct, when the College Music Society listed them as fulltime, concerns me.
2. Consider having your institution study comparative salary

and academic status of men and women faculty.

3. Consider requesting that one of the national organizations do a follow-up survey of items of concern. Alternately, consider administering a state of regional study of items of concern to you and your colleagues.

4. If you consider this paper to be helpful or informative please inform the University of North Texas; my university has invested some of its scarce research funding in supporting this work.

5. Please keep me apprised of subsequent and related work in this field.

This work was supported, in part by Faculty Research Grants from the University of North Texas, and by funds resulting from an Apple Educational Foundation grant.

Table 1.

Description of Total Surveys Returned, Both Complete and Blank

Returned filled in, women musicians (including some giving parttime status)	1,079
Returned filled in, women not in music (1 dance and 1 jewelry prof.)	2
Returned blank, men musicians, some with unpleasant comments	22
Returned blank, women musicians giving parttime status	16
Returned blank, with new address given by institution	1
Returned blank, noting that music department had been eliminated	1
Returned blank, noting that addressee was no longer member of faculty.	2
Returned a group piano survey (addressee confused the two?)	1
Returned blank, professors of dance.	2
Returned blank, with note that survey was considered offensive	1
Returned blank, with note that addressee would complete, if justification could be provided	1
Returned blank, with note that she didn't want to participate.	1
Returned blank, with note that she considered the survey too personal.	1
Returned blank and unopened, with unsigned note from Queens College, Aaron Copland School of Music: "Please remove the attached from your mailing list. These faculty members are on our staff, but they teach at their studios and are never on campus."	10
Returned blank, envelope marked "Deceased"	1
TOTAL SURVEYS RETURNED, BOTH COMPLETE AND BLANK	1,143

Figure 1.

Role of Performance In Our Lives

[question on survey]

Generally when you perform you pay more attention to (circle one):

	No. of answers	percent of answers
technique	267	57.2
emotional aspects	200	42.8

Do you take any type of beta-blocker (example: Inderal or Corgard) when you perform:

	No. of answers	percent of answers
always	24	02.4
sometimes	48	04.9
have tried it	57	05.8
never	857	86.9

Evaluation of significance of performance. Circle the corresponding number at the right that best fits the statement to the left:
1 = strongly agree; 5 = strongly disagree

	average of responses
I look forward to performing.	1.97
My anxiety interferes with my performing.	3.12
I am anxious when I perform	2.24

Table 2.

Age at which Music Was Chosen as Profession

Age Category, by Five-Year Interval	Number of Answers	Percentage of Total Answers
0- 5 years old	39	04.1%
6-10 years old	128	12.1%
11-15 years old	268	27.7%
16-20 years old	464	48.2%
21-25 years old	41	04.2%
26-30 years old	13	01.3%
over 30 years old	09	00.9%
Totals	961	99.5%

Table 3.

Jobs Held to Pay for Education

	Job Description	Number of Answers	Percentage of Total Answers
1.	taught private lessons . . .	626	22.2%
2.	performed professionally . .	467	16.6%
3.	taught at colleges	396	14.1%
4.	secretarial or clerical work	299	10.6%
5.	other (specify).	272	09.7%
6.	taught at public schools . .	182	06.5%
7.	worked in library.	183	06.5%
8.	worked in restaurant	159	05.7%
9.	worked as sales person . . .	125	04.4%
10.	tutored music.	105	03.7%
	Totals	2,814	100.0%

Table 4.

Rating of Obstacles to Education

[question on survey]

Rate the following statements below from 1 to 5, with 1 being the most difficult obstacle, that you have had to face in obtaining your education:

Description of Obstacle	Most Difficult		Average		Least Difficult	Standard Deviation
	1*	2	3	4	5	
Expense of education (N=1,031)			3.07			1.30
Access to other musicians (N=982)			3.79			1.19
Need for childcare (N=833)				4.21		1.33
Inadequate time for practice (N=1,004)		2.93				1.37
Quality of teachers (N=993)			3.83			1.17
Access to teachers (N=976)			3.84			1.19
Quality of performance opportunities (N=975)			3.50			1.20
Quality of curriculum (N=980)			3.85			1.13
Background deficiencies (N=995)			3.42			1.39
Lack of Professional positions in music (N=982)		2.98				1.38
Lack of mentors for women (networking) (N=973)			3.00			1.43
Anxiety in pursuing interests (N=981)			3.03			1.41
Competition (N=986)			3.09			1.24
Knowledge of opportunities in music (N=985)			3.17			1.26

*Note that no obstacle was rated at an average of 1, Most Difficult;
N=number of women responding to each description of obstacle

Table 5.

Ratings of Self-Description

[question on survey] Circle the corresponding number on the right that best fits the statement to the left: 1 = strongly agree; 5 = strongly disagree.

Statement of Self-Description	Agree		Neutral		Disagree	Standard Deviation
	1	2	3	*4	*5	
My professional status as a musician is crucial to me (N=1,027)	1.65					0.97
Marriage could have a positive effect on my career (N=981)		2.65				1.38
Children could have a positive effect on my career (N=971)			3.39			1.39
As compared with non-musician women I am more assertive (N=1,009)		2.61				1.22
As compared with men musicians, I am more assertive (N=1,014)			3.13			1.15
I am an excellent musician (N=1,027)	1.59					0.81
I enjoy making decisions (N=1,042)	1.95					1.09
My instrument is highly visible (soloistic) (N=994)	1.80					1.19
I easily trust others (N=1,037)		2.55				1.18
I mainly perform in groups (N=982)		2.90				1.47
I am a leader (N=1,036)	1.72					0.95
I am an extrovert (N=1,027)	1.42					1.27
I am intuitive (N=1,034)	1.62					0.88
I am highly political (N=1,023)			3.55			1.25
I have been sexually harassed in my career (N=1.020)			3.69			1.49
I need to see facts before making a decision (N=1,037)	1.67					0.84
I am an intellectual (N=1,038)	1.72					0.88
I am neat (not messy) (N=1,039)	1.99					1.08
I am highly creative (N=1,043)	1.85					0.83
I wear fashionable clothing (N=1,036)		2.33				1.10
I wear what feels comfortable (N=1,040)		2.07				0.96
I am emotional (N=1,039)	1.98					0.93
I am a perfectionist (N=1,038)	1.85					0.97
I am highly self-motivated (N=1,043)	1.54					0.81
I am anxious when I perform (N=1,015)		2.24				1.17
My anxiety interferes with my performing (N=1,010)			3.12			1.37
I look forward to performing (N=1,015)	1.97					1.06
I am ambitious (N=1,035)	1.88					0.96
I am paid less than male colleagues with the same training & experience (N=1,002)		2.62				1.56

*Note that no statement was rated at an average of 4 or 5;
N=number of women responding to each descriptive statement

Table 6.

Areas of Professional Specialization

[question on survey] Circle below how you would classify yourself:
Performer--Instrumentalist (specify instrument):_____
Performer--Vocalist
Non-performer (specify area):_____

No. of Answers	Response to Question
267	voice
232	piano
89	strings, including harp
74	musicologist, including ethnomusicology
70	wind, including sax and piccolo
69	music education
47	conductor
46	harpsichord and organ
25	theorist
22	piano/harpsichord and organ
17	brass
13	composer
11	music therapy
08	other instruments, including lute, recorder & guitar
08	theorist/musicologist
08	theorist/composer
08	librarian
08	strings/piano
06	wind/piano
04	conductor/piano
03	conductor/voice
03	music education/theorist
03	voice/strings
03	conductor/other
02	percussion
02	conductor/brass
02	voice/piano
02	composer/musicologist
02	conductor/theorist
02	conductor/musicologist
02	piano/theorist
02	music education/conductor
02	strings/conductor
01	wind/other instruments
01	composer/piano
01	conductor/wind
01	wind/other instruments/brass
01	wind/strings/piano
01	brass/piano
01	brass/voice/piano
01	composer/wind
01	conductor/harpsichord & organ
01	piano/harpsichord and organ/brass
01	piano/harpsichord and organ/strings
01	piano/music therapy
01	conductor/voice/harpsichord & organ
01	conductor/theorist/other
01	theorist/other
01	music education/piano/voice
01	music therapy/piano/other instruments
01	music therapy/music education
01	musicologist/piano
01	harpsichord and organ/theorist
01	administrator/other
01	voice/other
01	conductor/musicologist/other
01	music education/music therapy/other
01	music education/musicologist/librarian
01	music education/musicologist/other
01	administrator/theorist
01	music education/other
00	administrator

Table 7.

Expanded and Combined Categories of Specialization

1. piano, harpsichord and organ: total, 295

2. voice: total, 267

3. multiple responsibilities: total, 169

4. musicology and theory: total, 106

5. strings, including harp: total, 83

6. music education and music therapy: total, 81

7. wind, including sax and piccolo: total, 70

8. composers and conductors: total, 60

(totals equal 1,131 due to multiple-line entries)